Submitter	No	Submitter Comments	Applicant Response
Hospitality Total Services (Aus) Pty Ltd	1	Deficiencies of the Application 2. On being notified of the application, the Objector contacted the Shire for more information, as the notification did not provide any details outlining: - The size of the new browse area at the Mundijong Hotel. - What building works would be required. - The type and number of products that would be available. - How the new Bottle Shop and Drive Thru foot print would impact on the Mundijong locality (Traffic impact, harm and ill-health, impact on amenity etc). - What harm minimisation policies, strategies and initiatives would be implemented at the proposed new premises to ensure that levels of alcohol-related harm and ill-health did not rise due to the new, expanded packaged liquor offering at the premises.	2-Refer plans for size of browse area and building works requiredProducts made available will be typical of a bottle shop product range which will only be determined as required on a day by day consumer-based assessmentRefer attached cover C20001.2 letter for comments on traffic impactSocial impact has been considered, refer below for comments
		3. Subject to our contact with the Shire of Serpentine-Jarrahdale, we were advised that the only information relating to the application was a Site Plan, a Floor Plan and a single elevation for the front of the premises, that did not show any shelving, coolrooms etc.	<u>3</u> -Shelving and coolroom has been shown on floor plan
		4. As local residents, and business operators who have served the locality safely and well for many years, the Objector believes that more information is required so they can evaluate the Planning Application thoroughly, however no detailed submissions have been provided.	4-Dismiss - While the community is permitted to make comment on planning applications, it is not their role to evaluate planning applications nor are they qualified to do so. Also, the objector may only speak for themselves and not the community It is also pertinent to note that this shire has already previously approved for this bottle shop of
		The Application 5. The application is for the approval of a new browse-style Bottle Shop and adjacent Drive-Thru on Paterson Street in Mundijong.	which this application has been based on

Submitter No	Submitter Comments	Applicant Response
	6. The Objector submits that approval of the application would: - Significantly increase the footprint of packaged liquor in the locality. - Make liquor more easily accessible via the Drive-Thru amenity and potentially encourage drink driving. 7. Adversely impact on the local community with respect to increased access to and footprint of packaged liquor does not appear to have been considered by the Applicant (i.e. how will they mitigate and minimise negative impact to local community). - Potentially increase rates of crime. - Potentially increase the demand on the local health system with respect to alcohol-related harm. - Have a negative impact on traffic on Paterson Road, a busy road in Mundijong. There was no Traffic Impact Assessment provided with the application to assure local residents and businesses that there would no negative impact as a result of approving the proposal.	6-Dismiss – Opinion based. There is no real evidence that suggest a drive-thru amenity will encourage drink driving. 7-Dismiss - Any adverse impact on the local community with regard to the footprint of packaged liquor can really only be considered minor as it will form part of an already licensed area. Any evidence that suggest 'potential' increases in crime or injury is based on the provision of a new liquor outlet where one is not present. This bottle shop drive thru is actually to be an extension of an already operational licensed location. Instead of getting take-away liquor over the bar they will now be able to get it direct from a drive thru. -Dismiss negative traffic impact. Refer comments in cover letter C20001.2. In addition, by noting that Paterson St is the busy street in Mundijong, then it stands to reason that it would have a positive impact on the traffic by preventing parking on the street or across the road to obtain their take away alcohol.
	7. Please find below some details that the Applicant has not addressed in the Planning Application:	<u>7</u> - Objective

Submitter	No	Submitter Co	mments			Applicant Response	
		8. Currently i supply liquor	n Mundijonչ :	e footprint of pac g the following pr	8Dismiss as - 1. The drive thru will be part of the Mundijong tavern which already allows for the sale of take away alcohol, just not in the safest manner.		
		60200112 05	LIQ- Tavern	Mundijong Tavern	Southern Liquor Pty Ltd	Patterson Street MUNDIJONG WA 6123	2. It is my understanding that the Whitby Falls restaurant at South Western Highway has long since closed with no outlook of reopening anytime soon.
		60300355 35	LIQ- Liquor Store	Cellarbrations at Mundijong	N And M Gangemi Nominees Pty Ltd	20 PATERSON STREET MUNDIJONG WA 6123	REET 3. The Football club is a restricted venue and is not
		60600224 91	LIQ- Restaura nt	Historic Whitby Falls Centre	Godfrey Richard Charles Howard	STH WESTERN HWY MUNDIJONG WA 6123	NOTE: The suburb of Byford has a population of 16112 as per 2016 census which currently houses 13 Licensed Premises (publicly accessed) according to liquor and gaming. 1 outlet per 1240pop.
		61900216 59	LIQ-Club Restricte d	Centrals Football & Sportsmans Club Inc	Centrals Football & Sportsmans Club Inc	MUNDIJONG RESERVE MUNDIJONG WA 6123	Mundijong currently has 1 outlet per 3175pop. Pop.

Submitter No.	Submitter Comments	Applicant Response
	Traffic Impact 10. Please find below a map identifying the location of the premises that sell liquor on Paterson Road and the other community amenity located in very close proximity: Mundjong Primary School Livesey St. Mundjong Primary School Livesey St. Mundjong Tamily Practice Family Practice Mundjong Tamily Practice Mundjong Tamily Practice Mundjong Fish & Chips IGA Mundjong Mundjong Fish & Chips IGA Mundjong Railway Park	10-Not applicable
	11. As can be seen on review of the above map, there are two outlets able to sell takeaway packaged liquor in close proximity on Paterson Street, along with a	<u>11</u> -Dismiss - One of the two outlets <u>is</u> the Mundijong Hotel of which the Bottle shop is

Submitter	No	Submitter Comments	Applicant Response
		number of public amenity buildings, many of which are regularly accessed by children that include (but are not limited to): a. Mundijong Public Library, b. Serpentine Jarrahdale Community Resource Centre, c. Mundijong Railway Park, d. Mundijong Railway Station, and e. 252 and 253 bus stops.	In addition, Dismiss - Opinion based- What evidence is given to suggest that children regularly access these public amenities as opposed to say be being driven and using carparks provided
		12. It is entirely plausible that children who attend the Mundijong Primary School on Livesey Street would walk from the school to any of the aforementioned amenity after school, and to do so they must walk directly past the Mundijong Tavern.	12-Dismiss – we suggest that given the hotel is at the center of the towns commercial area with Mundijong locale (of which they have based their population in item 17) being located entirely to the west, it is unlikely that any school children living in this area would travel this route to get to school. We do not dismiss the fact that children or any pedestrians may walk past this hotel on occasion.
		13. The Applicant has not provided any public interest reasons why they are applying to install a large browse area bottle shop and drive-thru. Further, there is no information available as to: a- How the proposal may impact traffic in the locality during peak periods. b- How any increase in traffic is to be managed.	13-It will benefit traffic, refer cover letter C20001.2 b-Dismiss – refer previous comment opp section 12 c-Already answered
		c- How any increase in traffic is to be managed. d- How that traffic management will occur and who will bear the costs. 14. The Objector notes that children departing the Mundijong Primary School would be likely to walk past the proposed new drive-thru amenity on their way home, on their way to the local park, library of the resource centre.	d-not applicable 14-Dismiss – opinion based and without evidence

Submitter	No	Submitter Com	ıments				Applicant Response
		Development A E16/2904 – Up requirements f	the Mandatory I Approval by the S dated November for applications o elopment genera peak hours"	ce 'Y : if: <i>"Non-</i>	15-We believe this has been answered by the positive impact this will have on traffic however further information can be provided upon request		
	 16. The Objector was not provided with any information that demonstrates that the Applicant has seriously considered the traffic implications of establishing the drive-thru on local vehicular and pedestrian traffic. Locality - Population 17. In Mundijong there is no forecast population growth, and the population over the past 15 years has actually declined in real terms. Please find below a table collating the 2006, 2011 and 2016 Census Data for Mundijong: 						16 Dismiss – Repetitive. refer previous comments
							<u>17</u> -Dismiss – Evidence by the objector is incorrect. All evidence suggests that the population in Mundijong is growing. The numbers stated incorrectly by the objector only
			2016 Census	2011 Census	2006 Census		reflects the immediate Mundijong urban center and not the suburb of Mundijong which as of 2016
		(Source:	1232 on table for Mundijo .gov.au/websitedbs,		e/Census?OpenDocument	&ref=topBar	census stands at 6351pop. https://quickstats.censusdata.abs.gov.au/census services/qet product/census/2016/quickstat/506061143?opendocument Subsequently the 'locale' population has actually grown since 2006. Refer 2006 – 877 population https://quickstats.censusdata.abs.gov.au/census services/get product/census/2006/quickstat/UCL520000?opendocument 2011 – 1429 population https://quickstats.censusdata.abs.gov.au/census services/qet product/census/2011/quickstat/UCL521042?opendocument 2016 – 1484 population

Submitter	No	Submitter Comments	Applicant Response
			https://quickstats.censusdata.abs.gov.au/census_services/qet product/census/2016/quickstat/UCL521041?opendocument
		18. As can see on review of the table above, the population in Mundijong has decrease by 17.6% over the past 15 years. Accordingly, there is no growing consumer demand or population demanding more access and availability to packaged liquor in the Mundijong locality.	18 Dismiss - As previously noted the shire supports the statistical data that the suburb of Mundijong will grow 530% in the next 16yrs to over 20,000 as previously noted. https://forecast.id.com.au/serpentine-jarrahdale/about-forecast-areas?WebID=150
		Alcohol-Related Harm in Mundijong 19. The Objector notes that an increase in packaged liquor foot print, will result in an increase in alcohol-related harm. This is a notorious fact and is supported by many research papers and decisions of the licensing authority.	19 -Noted, however Dismiss. with the growth of this community it is expected there will be the need to replicate retail outlets and other services.
		20. Further, the Supreme Court of Western Australia (Laveson Pty Ltd -v- Smith & Anor [2003] WASCA 2861) has previously found that one (1) packaged liquor outlet per 2,500 was evidence of consumer demand. In Mundijong, there are two (2) packaged liquor outlets for a population of 1,232; which is considered ample for the population residing in the locality.	<u>20</u> -Dismiss- the objectors argument is based on the Mundijong urban centre locale population only and not the suburb of Mundijong at the very least
		21. One measure of alcohol-related harm can be the rate of crime in an area or suburb.	21 -Noted — Dismiss as relevance is objective
		22. Crime Statistics provided by the WA Police indicate that the rate of criminal offences are higher in Mundijong than in neighbouring suburbs Mardella and Cardup, as demonstrated in the table below:	22 - Dismiss — based on incorrect population data used as basis of evidence

Submitter	No	Submitter Con	nments		Applicant Response		
			2016 population	% of population	Crimes in 18/192	% of suburbs	-Dismiss – based on incorrect population data
		Mundijong	1232 ₃	43.66%	90	58.82%	
		Cardup	11104	39.33%	45	29.41%	Note: Cardup is typo and should be 1110pop.
		Mardella	480 5	17.01%	18	11.76%	
		TOTAL	2822	1000.00%	153	99.99%	
		in the Crime S current popula	tatistics comp ation data fror	v of the table ab ared to its neigh m the ABS 2016	23 -Dismiss- again, evidence is based on the population of the urban center only. If you use the current population of Mundijong area (6351), the Mundijong population percentage skyrockets to 80.42% with Cardup at 13.67% and Mardella at 5.91%. Note: Crime in Mundijong for 2019-2020 has been the lowest since 2011 at 65 despite population increases https://www.police.wa.gov.au/Crime/CrimeStatistics#/		
		Alcohol-Relate 24. Another m Alcohol-relate Health and is a	neasure of the d hospitalisati	24 -Dismiss – based on incorrect population data used as evidence refer note above opp point 23			
				e showing the in of Serpentine Ja	creasing rate of al rrahdale:	25 -Dismiss – based on incorrect population data used as evidence refer note above opp point 23	
					d Hospitalisations		asea as evidence rejer note above opp point 25
				2002 - 2006	2005 - 2009	2007 - 2011	<u> </u>
		Standardised	d Data Datio	0.62*	0.66*	0.70*	

Submitter	No	Submitter Comments	5	Applicant Response			
		Number of alcohol- related hospitalisat		282	3	371	
1 https://jade.io/article/143107 2 https://www.police.wa.gov.au/Crime/CrimeStatistics#/start 3ABS2016QuickStatsMundijong 4ABS2016QuickStatsCardup 5ABS2016QuickStatsMardella							
	Cost of alcohol- related hospitalisations \$1,088,153.21 \$1,733,852,70 \$2,443,972						-Dismiss – based on incorrect population data used
		INCREASE / DECREASE		INCREASE	INCREA	SE	as evidence refer note above opp point 23
		26. As can be seen or steady increase in the Serpentine Jarrahdale	e number of Alc	cohol-related hosp	oitalisations i	<u>26</u> -Dismiss – based on incorrectpopulation data used as evidence refer note above opp point 23	
		27. The cost of treating related hospitalisation the 2002-2006 period	ons per capita ha	<u>27</u> -Dismiss – based on incorrect population data used as evidence refer note above opp point 23			
		-	cost of treating Alcohol-related hospitalisations has increased e 2002 – 2011 period.				28 -Noted, however this application is not a new out let but an extension to an existing outlet which is unlikely to survive today's global climate without
	WALGA Report 29. Further, the Planning Application to the Shire of Serpentine-Jarrahdale does not appear to address any of the matters outlined in the document: "WA Local"						change and adaption 29 -Noted. Relevance is objective

SUMMARY OF SUBMISSIONS

Proposed Drive-Through Liquor Store – Lot 6 (32) and Lot 5 (34) Paterson Street, Mundijong

Submitter	No	Submitter Comments Applicant Response
		Government Association 2018: Managing Alcohol in Our Communities: A Guide for Local Government, Western Australia." (Attachment 3)
		30. The report outlines the following negative impacts on local government areas as a result of the misuse of alcohol:
		The impact of harm ful alcohol consumption to Local Government The problems associated with harm ful alcohol use impact both directly and indirectly on Local Government operations in Western Australia. As the level of government that is closest to the community, Local Government sees a number of impacts from alcohol-related harm. Some of these impacts include:
		Nuisance, including noise and anti-social behaviour from intoxicated persons. Negative impacts to community health and wellbeing.
		Infrastructure capacity problems including limited availability of transport and car parking. Alcohol-related litter.
		Violence and perceived threats to safety. Waste management and cleaning costs in public places and entertainment precincts.
		Crime including vandalism, trespass and property damage. Alcohol-related crashes.
		Table 4: Excerpt from the WALGA report

Population based education. **Ninimum drinking age.** **Some cultural leadership on low risk alcohol consumption.** **Population based education.** **Population	Submitter	No	Submitt	er Comment	s				Applicant Response
from alcohol aimed at education and capacity to respond effectively. Health responses to acute and chronic alcohol-related harm. Health responses to acute and chronic alcohol-related harm. Enforcement of	Submitter	No	31. The Mundijo availabi 32. The government their are	Objector not ong and large lity and access report also report also reports can impeas of control of the control	tes that the above or Serpentine Jarrass to alcohol wou notes that Develop pact and better col: les of Alcohol Manage of the three layers of Go National Taxation. Competition Policy. Advertising controls. Pricing. Minimum drinking age. Some cultural leadership on low risk alcohol consumption.	ahdale area, and a ld exacerbate those ld exacerbate those pment Approvals a control the prolifer ment exercises. State Liquor licensing structures and processes including trading hours, licensing trading hours, licensing requirements and fees. Banning of specific alcohol products. Planning zones and legislation. Population based education.	Local Development Approvals, planning of outlet density and hours of operation. Community amenity. Ensuring community safety, health and wellbeing through facilitating access to services. Community lease management and participation with sporting clubs. Work with local agencies to address drinking cultures.	e local	32 -Noted: however we suggest relevance is objective given the actual circumstances of this particular application. 32 -Noted: However given this is the extension of an already licensed area that this aspect has been
Health and housing agreements. Some cultrual leadership on addressing drinking cultures, attitudes and values. Figure 1 Bounce, Adapted from National Local Covernment Drug and Alcohol Advisory Committee 2008. Some leadership on addressing drinking cultures, attitudes and values.				individual harm is from alcohol	states and agencies aimed at education and capacity to respond effectively. Health and housing agreements. Some cultural leadership on acceptance of alcohol.	and crime. Health responses to acute and chronic alcohol-related harm. Some leadership on addressing drinking cultures, attitudes and	Facilitating local community responses to health needs. Enforcement of		

Submitter	No	Submitter Comments	Applicant Response
		33. As outlined above, Development Approvals are one effective way that local government can reduce outlet density, availability of and access to liquor.	33 - Dismiss – Repetitive - Already noted in point 32 above
		State Government Legislation 34. The Western Australian State Government, Department of Local Government, Sport and Cultural Industries (DLGSC) now includes the Department of Racing, Gaming and Liquor.	<u>34</u> -Noted
		35. In November 2019, new legislation was introduced that specifically addressing: "Concern regarding the impact of the proliferation of large packaged liquor outlets on the community has resulted in legislative provisions that allow regulations to be prescribed setting out criteria that apply to applications for large packaged liquor outlets."	35 -Dismiss - We believe this legislation was introduced specifically for the likes of 'Dan Murphy's' which are large packaged areas. It would be unfair to suggest that this bottle shop is in a similar category.
		36. The new legislation specifically targets: "The new provisions apply to the retail section of new liquor store, hotel and tavern licence applications as well as applications to alter or redefine a licensed premises subject to those licence types."	36 -Dismiss — Refer above note 35
		37. The Objector submits that the application by the Mundijong Hotel will certainly increase the retail section of the area selling packaged liquor, will be subject to the new legislation and should be seriously considered by the Shire of Serpentine Jarrahdale when evaluating the DA application.	37-Dismiss – based on the fact that apart from the hotel itself, there is only one other liquor outlet in the immediate area openly available to the public
		Summary 38. The application is clearly deficient and does not include the requisite information to properly determine the impacts on the local community of a new Bottle Shop and Drive-Thru.	38 - Dismiss on the basis the objectors evidence is at times incorrect, unwarranted and its relevance objective.

Submitter	No	Submitter Comments	Applicant Response
		39. Concerns including the impact on the community due to increase accessibility of liquor, larger footprint for packaged liquor, impact on traffic in the locality (particularly during peak periods) and	39 -Noted: Relevance is objective
		negative impacts on the local community (including children) have not been considered.	-Relevance objective and noted above
		40. Accordingly, the Objector submits that the Planning Application in its current form should not be approved.	-Objective
Planning Solutions	2	We refer to the development application lodged with the Shire of Serpentine Jarrahdale for the development of a Mundijong Tavern Bottle Shop Drive Thru at Lots 5 and 6 (32-34) Paterson Street, Mundijong (subject site).	
		Our client's property adjoins the rear of the subject site, separated only by a 4.95m-wide, unconstructed laneway. On behalf of our client, we object to the proposed development in the strongest possible terms . We submit the proposed development application is deficient and it should be refused in the interests of orderly and proper planning. The grounds for our objection are provided below:	
		1• The lack of detail on the proposed development plans including layout of internal floor areas means the proposed use cannot be accurately assessed in terms of scale and operations.	<u>1</u> -Dismiss- All plans are to scale
		2• There is no information provided with the application to demonstrate the proposed vehicle movements are appropriate. A drive thru liquor store (and existing tavern) is expected to generate significant levels of traffic which has a real prospect of causing detriment to adjoining properties. This is particularly the case where access is proposed to a 4.95m-wide unconstructed laneway which adjoins residential properties. The development application is deficient in information and it would be inconsistent with orderly and proper planning to approve this application without having sufficient information to assess traffic impacts.	2-Objective — Please note that this layout was based on a previous application that was approved by the Serpentine Jarrahdale Planning Department

Submitter	No	Submitter Comments	Applicant Response
		3• The existing Mundijong Tavern is not provided with formalised parking. There is insufficient information provided with the application to demonstrate the proposed car parking area is sufficient to cater to the operations of both the existing tavern and proposed drive thru liquor store.	<u>3</u> -Dismiss — As previously noted, there is no carparking allocated for the Mundijong Hotel due to its heritage nature and site constraints. Therefore any carparking will provide relief of which the proposed carparking provided is in excess of requirements stated in the previous approved
		4• The proposal for access from the laneway is not appropriate. The laneway is not sealed and traffic along the laneway will cause dust and noise nuisance to adjoining properties.	application. In addition, Drive-thrus do not use carparks. 4-Noted: this access was shown with respect to the previous approved application to offer optional access to the drive thru and carpark however this may be depending on laneway reserves from adjacent properties.
		5• Further, the laneway is not wide enough to allow two-way traffic. Allowing commercial traffic onto the laneway will create conflicts with other legitimate users of the laneway, including future houses and dwellings with access to the laneway.	<u>5</u> -Noted: Refer note above. Additionally it is the shire's decision to widen the laneway to benefit all owners adjoining the laneway
		6• While the plans show entry-only from the laneway, in practice it will not be possible to regulate this and there is every likelihood of conflict between vehicles in the laneway and/or at the rear entrance to the tavern car park.	6-Opinion based and Objective — Unlikely however signage clearly stating entry/no entry will be posted. In addition, users of the drive thru will automatically exit onto Paterson St
		7• We are concerned that with entry provided from the laneway, signage will need to be installed on Whitby Street and Richardson Street to direct customers to the liquor store. The dust and noise from traffic directed along the laneway, and the visual amenity caused by signage at either end of the laneway, will erode the amenity of the locality.	<u>7</u> -Noted

Submitter	No	Submitter Comments	Applicant Response
		8• The proposed drive thru bottle shop and associated car park area will have a detrimental impact on the amenity of the adjoining property owners through increased noise and alcohol-related activities from customers at the subject site. No information has been provided with the application in respect of the noise or amenity impacts on the adjoining residential properties, which is a critical matter to be considered in determining this application.	8Noted: Considered somewhat objective as this is proposal is within the main central hub of Mundijong with several properties to the north zoned for Major Commercial Development as per the shire's Paterson St Guidelines. That said, a masonry wall to the rear of the carpark has been provided with the consideration of the neighbouring properties to the rear (west)
		9 In summary, the proposed development application is deficient in information and will have a significant detrimental impact on the adjoining property owners in terms of traffic, access, safety, and amenity. For these reasons, we submit the proposed application should not be supported by the Shire's officers, nor approved by Council.	9-Objective
		We thank you for your consideration of the points made in this submission and respectfully request we are invited to attend any Council meeting at which this application is considered.	
		Should you have any queries or require further clarification in regard to the above matter please do not hesitate to contact the writer. Yours sincerely,	